United States Department of Agriculture



Forest Service



May 2003

Draft Environmental Impact Statement

Elk Bugs and Fuels Project

Northern Hills Ranger District, Black Hills National Forest Lawrence and Meade Counties, South Dakota

The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) prohibits discrimination in all its programs and activities on the basis of race, color, national origin, gender, religion, age, disability, political beliefs, sexual orientation, or marital or family status. (Not all prohibited bases apply to all programs.) Persons with disabilities who require alternative means for communication of program information (Braille, large print, audiotape, etc.) should contact USDA's TARGET Center at (202) 720-2600 (voice and TDD). To file a complaint of discrimination, write USDA, Director, Office of Civil Rights, Room 326-W, Whitten Building, 14th and Independence Avenue, SW, Washington, DC 20250-9410 or call (202) 720-5964 (voice and TDD). USDA is an equal opportunity provider and employer.

Elk Bugs and Fuels

Draft Environmental Impact Statement

Lawrence and Meade Counties, South Dakota

Lead Agency: USDA Forest Service

Cooperating Agencies: Lawrence County, South Dakota

Responsible Official: John C. Twiss, Forest Supervisor

RR 2, Box 200 Custer, SD 57730

For Information Contact: Elizabeth Krueger,

National Environmental Policy Act Coordinator

Northern Hills Ranger District,

2014 N. Main Street

Spearfish, South Dakota, 57783

307-283-1361

Abstract: The Elk Bugs and Fuels Project is located in the northeastern portion of the Black Hills National Forest in Lawrence and Meade counties, South Dakota. Mountain pine beetle attacks in the Beaver Park area reached an epidemic stage several years ago. Mountain pine beetles have been moving out from the Beaver Park area and have now reached epidemic stages in adjoining areas. P.L. 107-206 was signed on August 2, 2002, allowing immediate treatment of the Beaver Park area as well as a specific amount of treatments in adjoining areas. The Black Hills National Forest has determined that more treatments than those authorized in P.L. 107-206 are necessary in order to reduce the spread of mountain pine beetle populations. Existing vegetative conditions, in addition to dead and dying trees caused by mountain pine beetle attacks, have created conditions making the area susceptible to catastrophic fire events. The Elk Bugs and Fuels Project was developed to reduce the spread of mountain pine beetle populations and to reduce the susceptibility of vegetation to catastrophic fire events. Public review of the Proposed Action during the scoping period identified seven issues. These issues led to the development of four alternatives considered in detail, including no new federal action. Alternative 1, No Action, proposes no additional treatments to reduce the spread of mountain pine beetle populations or to reduce the susceptibility of the project area to potential catastrophic fire events. Alternative 2, the Modified Proposed Action, proposes to create fuel breaks along selected roads and to reduce the basal area in many stands making them less susceptible to mountain pine beetle attacks and more resistant to large catastrophic fire events. Alternative 3, Wildlife Emphasis, changes the configuration of some of the stands to be treated and, where appropriate, thins them to a lower basal area than Alternative 1 in order to provide more grass/forb habitat. Alternative 4, Wildland Urban Interface, adopts a suggestion provided by the Lawrence County Fire Advisory Board. It proposes the same treatments as Alternative 2 and additional treatments near private property where possible. All of the action alternatives propose decommissioning

roads no longer needed for management purposes. The forest Service Preferred Alternative for this Draft Environmental Impact Statement is Alternative 4.

Reviewers should provide the Forest Service with their comments during the review period of the draft environmental impact statement. This will enable the Forest Service to analyze and respond to the comments at one time and to use the information acquired in the preparation of the final environmental impact statement, thus avoiding undue delay in the decision making process. Reviewers have an obligation to structure their participation in the National Environmental Policy Act process so that it is meaningful and alerts the agency to the reviewers' position and contentions. (Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. NRDC, 435 U.S. 519, 553 (1978)). Environmental objections that could have been raised at the draft stage may be waived if not raised until after completion of the final environmental impact statement. (City of Angoon v. Hodel (9th Circuit, 1986)) and (Wisconsin Heritages, Inc. v. Harris, 490 F. Supp. 1334, 1338 (E.D. Wis. 1980)). Comments on the draft environmental impact statement should be specific and should address the adequacy of the statement and the merits of the alternatives discussed (40 CFR 1503.3).

Send Comments to: Carl Leland, US Forest Service

US Post Office, Room 201 18 South Mill Avenue Ridgway, PA 15853

The comment period closes 45 days after the Notice of Availability is published in the Federal Register.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1. Purpose of and Need for Action	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Document Structure	
Introduction	
Project Area Location	
Background	
Management Areas	
Purpose and Need for Action	
Proposed Action	
Decision Framework	
Public Involvement	
Other Related Efforts	
Chapter 2 Alternatives, Including the proposed action	
Introduction	
Alternatives Considered in Detail	
Vegetative Treatments	
Commercial Thinning	
Non-commercial Thinning	
Commercial Hardwood Restoration	
Non-commercial Hardwood Restoration	
Sanitation Cutting	
Bait and Sanitation Cutting/Commercial Thinning	
	.Error! Bookmark not defined.
Shaded Fuel Breaks	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Meadow Enhancement	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Patch Cuts (Wildlife Habitat Prescription)	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Transportation Activities	Error! Bookmark not defined.
New Construction	.Error! Bookmark not defined.
Reconstruction	.Error! Bookmark not defined.
Decommissioning	.Error! Bookmark not defined.
Alternative 1: No Action	
Alternative 2: Modified Proposed Action	
Alternative 3: Wildlife Emphasis	
Alternative 4: Wildland Urban Interface Emphasis.	
Alternatives Considered but Eliminated from Detailed Stud	
Comparison of Alternatives	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Summary Comparison of Alternatives By Proposed	Treatments Error! Bookmark
not defined.	
Comparison of the Alternatives to the Issues	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Narrative Summary Comparison of Alternatives by Resour	
Physical Environment	
Soil and Water	
Transportation	
Fuels	
Biological Environment	
Vegetation	
Wildlife	
17 IIGIIIC	.LII or . Doormark not utilitu.

Fisheries	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Botany	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Noxious Weeds	
Range	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Social Environment.	
Recreation	
Scenery	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Heritage	
Economics	
Mitigation Common to All Alternatives	
Monitoring Common To All Action Alternative	
Consistency with Revised Forest Plan and Phas	
not defined.	
Chapter 3 Affected Environment and Environmental	Consequences Front Bookmark not defined
Physical Environment	
Hydrology and Soils	
Affected Environmet	
Geology	
Climate and Watersheds	
Soils, Erosion, Compaction, Heating, and Nu	
defined.	
Stream Flow Regimes	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Water Quality	
Name	
Water-Road Interactions, Sediment and Conr	
Bookmark not defined.	
Riparian Areas and Wetlands	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Channel Morphology	
Floodplains	
Other Activities within the Project Area Influ	
Bookmark not defined.	
Environmental Consequences	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Soil Erosion, Compaction, Heating, and Nutr	ient Loss Error! Bookmark not
defined.	
Mass Movement	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Stream Flow Regime	
Water Quality	
Channel Morphology	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Floodplains	
Riparian Zones and Wetlands	
Cumulative Effects	
Cumulative Effects inside the Project Area	
Soil Erosion, Compaction, Heating, and Nutr	rient Loss Error! Bookmark not
defined.	
Mass movement	
Stream Flow Regime	
Water Quality	Error! Bookmark not defined.

Channel Morphology	Ennont	Doolsmank not defined
Floodplains, Riparian Zones and Wetlands		
Cumulative Effects in the Analysis Area		
Transportation System		
Affected Environment		
Environmental Consequences		
Fire Hazard and Fuel Loading		
Affected Environment		
Fire Regime		
Hazard, Values and Risk		
PROBACRE INPUTS		
PROBACRE RESULTS		
Environmental Consequences:		
Air quality		
Cumulative Effects		
Cumulative Effects		
Biological Environment		
Forest Vegetation		
Affected Environment		
Environmental Consequences		
Direct and Indirect Effects		
Cumulative Effects		
Cumulative Effects of Public Law 107-206 Activi		
Boundary		
Wildlife Habitat		
Affected Environment		
Environmental Consequences		
THREATENED, ENDANGERED, AND SENSIT		
Specie specific Findings and Analysis of Effects		
American Dipper (Cinclus mexicanus)		
Cumulative Effects of Public Law 107-206 Activi		
Boundary	Error!	Bookmark not defined.
Fisheries		
Affected Environment:		
Environmental Consequences		
Cumulative Effects.		
Sensitive Plants		
Affected Environment		
Environmental Consequences		
Cumulative Effects.		
Rangeland		
Affected Environment		
Environmental Consequences		
Cumulative Effects		
Noxious Weeds		
Affected Environment		
Cumulative Effects		

Social Environment	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Recreation	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Affected Environment	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Environmental Consequences	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Cumulative Effects	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Scenery	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Affected Environment	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Scenic Attractiveness	
Visual Absorption Capability	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Landscape Visibility	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Recreation Opportunity Spectrum	
Scenic Classes	
Scenic Integrity	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Environmental Consequences	
Cumulative Effects	
Heritage Resources	
Affected Environment	
Environmental Consequences	
Cumulative Effects	
Economics	
Cumulative Effects	
Environmental Justice	Error!
Bookmark not defined.	
Short-term Uses and Long-term Productivity	
Unavoidable Adverse Effects Irreversible and Irretrievable Commitments of Resources	
Cumulative Effects	
Other Required Disclosures	
•	
Chapter 4 Consultation and Coordination	
Preparers and Contributors	
ID TEAM MEMBERS:	
FEDERAL, STATE, AND LOCAL AGENCIES:	
Indian Nations:	
OTHERS:	
Chapter 5: BIBLIOGRAPHY	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Appendix A: Public Involvement and Scoping	Error! Bookmark not defined.
APPENDIX B: MITIGATION MEASURES	
Mitigations Common to all Alternatives	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Resource	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Mitigation	
Unit Specific Mitigation Measures	
Resource	
Mitigation	
Mitigations Unique to Alternative 2	
Resource	
Mitigation	Error: Bookmark not defined.

Mitigations Unique to Alternative 4	
Resource	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Mitigation	
Appendix C: Monitoring Plan	
Purpose	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Soil and water	
Noxious weeds	
Fire and fuels	
Timber sale.	
Appendix D Stand Attributes	
Index	Error! Bookmark not defined.
List of Tables and Figures	
Figure 1 Management Areas	
Figure 2 Hydrologic Unit Codes 7th level sub-watersheds	
Figure 3 Primary Travel Ways	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Figure 4 Landscape Character after Thinning Treatments	
Figure 6 Results of Large Tree Retention with Understory Burn	
Table 1 Elk Bugs and Fuels Project Location	
Table 2 Alternative 2 Proposed Treatments and Activities	
Table 3 Alternative 3 Proposed Treatments and Activities	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 4 Alternative 4 Proposed Treatments and Activities	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 6 Response of Alternatives to Issues	
Table 7 Proposed Transportation Activities by Alternative	
Table 8 Road Density by Alternative in Miles/Square Mile	
Table 9 Percentage of Open and Closed Roads by Alternative	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 10 Present net value and benefit/cost ratios	
Table 11 Summary of Natural Watershed Sensitivity and Impact Indices	s, and Watershed Class* Error!
Bookmark not defined.	
Table 12 Major Soil Types and Their Characteristics of the Elk Bugs and not defined.	·
Table 13 Soils with Mass Movement Potential	
Table 14 Soils with Mass Movement Potential, Their Acreage, and Numb	
Table 15 Soils Characteristics Related to Potential Road Concerns	
Table 16 Summary of Beneficial Uses for Designated Stream Segments	
Table 17 Summary of Beneficial Uses for Streams Crossing Through the	
Stream Segments	
Table 18 Existing Overall Road Densities for Portions of Watersheds Lo Bookmark not defined.	cated Within the Project Area Error!
Table 19 Summary of Road Densities within 300 ft of Streams, By Owne	rshin and Watershed Number (#
Miles/Sq. Miles)	
Table 20 Summary of Road Densities within the Riparian Zone, By Own	
miles)	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 21 Summary of Roads Affecting Wetlands Mapped By US Fish an Bookmark not defined.	d Wildlife, 1995 (USFWS, 1995) Error!
Table 22 List of Streams with Modified and/or Isolated Floodplains	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 23 Roads Crossing Streams Multiple Times or Located in Drainag	ge BottomsError! Bookmark not defined.
Table 24 Soil Effects and Treatments Summary Table	
Table 25 Summary of Existing and Alternative Road Densities	
Table 26 Summary of Potential Erosion Rates	
Table 27 Summary of Organia Timber soles and Legislated Actions	
Table 28 Summary of Ongoing Timber sales and Legislated Actions	

Project Area	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 30 Summarizing the Increase in Potential Erosion from vegetation treatmen	ts by A	Alternative a	and	
Watershed				J.
Table 31 Summary of Roads Decommissioned and Built By Alternative	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	ı.
Table 32 Cumulative Effect of Proposed Road Decommissioning or Construction of				
Potential				
Table 33 Ranges in Potential Sediment Increases to Streams				
Table 34 Existing Transportation System				
Table 35 Road Management				
Table 36 No Forest Service Right-Of-Way				
Table 37 Proposed Transportation Activities by Alternative				
Table 38 Road Density by Alternative in Miles/Square Mile				
Table 39 Percentage of Open and Closed Roads by Alternative	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	ı.
Table 40-Predicted fire behavior comparison in bug-killed trees with red needles a	ttache	ed, and after	the dead	
trees have fallen	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 41 – The Five Historic Natural Fire Regime Groups	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 42 Condition Class descriptions	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 43 Suppression objectives by management area,				
Table 44 Fire Occurrence for FMZ 2	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	ı.
Table 45 Fire Management Zone 2				
Table 46 Reduction of Fuel Hazard Ratings				
Table 47 Fuels and Fire Behavior Indicators				
Table 48 Percent of Post Treatment Fire type for Treated Units				
Table 49 Fire Regime Condition Class				
Table 50 Particulate Production				
Table 51 Typical Broadcast Burn Factors				
Table 52- Recent Timber Sales Within Elk Bugs and Fuel Project Area				
Table 53 - Acres of Vegetation Treatment; 1980s - Planned (RMRIS data)				
Table 54 Fire Regime Condition Class				
Table 55 Recent Timber Sales within the Cumulative Effects Area				
Table 56 Past, Present and Foreseeable Timber Sales				
Table 57 - Forest Plan Management Areas (RMRIS data, GIS acres)	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 58 - Timber Suitability (RMRIS data, GIS acres)	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 59 - Forest Cover types (RMRIS data, GIS acres)				
Table 60 - Habitat Types and General Characteristics				
Table 61 - Cover Type Age-Class Based on Stand Year-Of-Origin (RMRIS data)				
Table 62 - Stocking by Cover Type Based on % of Average Maximum Density (AM				
Table 02 - Stocking by Cover Type based on 70 of Average Maximum Bensity (Alv	Errorl	Rookmark	not defined	4
Table 63 - Risk of Mountain Pine Beetle Caused Losses in Pine Stands	Errorl	Dookmark	not defined	1 1.
Table 65 - Risk of Mountain Fine Beetle Caused Losses in Fine Stands				
Table 65 - Recent Timber Sales Within Elk bugs and fuels Project Area				
Table 66 - Acres of Vegetation Treatment; 1980s - Planned (RMRIS data)				
Table 67 Post-Treatment Mountain Pine Beetle Risk				
Table 68 - Harvest Volume by Alternative				
Table 69 - ASQ Volume by Alternative				
Table 70 Post Treatment Ponderosa Pine Stocking				
Table 71 Recent Timber Sales within Elk Bugs and Fuels Project Area	Error!	Bookmark	not defined	J.
Table 72 Acres of Vegetation Treatment within Elk Bugs and Fuel Project Bounda	ry; 19	80s - Planne	ed (RMRIS	
data)				
Table 73 Recent Timber Sales within Elk Bugs and Fuels Cumulative Effects Area	and C	outside the I	Project Are	a
			•	
Table 74 Past and Planned Silviculture Treatments (RMRIS Data)				
Table 75 Ponderosa Pine Stands: Mountain Pine Beetle Risk				
Table 76 Post Treatment Green Tree Retention on Pine Sites by Aspect and Water				
defined.	siicu	LIIOI: D	JONIIIAIN IIC	Λ
	Crror!	Doolemark	not define	,
Table 77 Existing (Alternative 1) structural stage distribution by cover type				
Table 78 Alternative 2 structural stage distributions by cover type				
Table 79 Alternative 3 structural stage distributions by cover type				
Table 80 Alternative 4 structural stage distributions by cover type				
Table 81 Existing Pine Snags, 10" DBH and Larger (RMRIS Tree Data)				
Table 82 Post-Treatment Mountain Pine Beetle Risk				
Table 83 Habitat and Expected Occurrence of TEPS species within the project are	a	Error! Bo	ookmark no	ot
defined.				

Table 84 List of all wildlife species known or suspected to occur in the Elk Bugs a	nd Fuel Analysis Area Error!
Bookmark not defined.	
Table 85 Habitat Improvement Activities and Road Densities	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 86 Habitat Effectiveness Values by Alternative	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 87 Existing Habitat Structural Stages, Cumulative Effects Area	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 88 Post-Treatment Habitat Structural Stages, Cumulative Effects Area	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 89 Habitat Effectiveness Indices, Cumulative Effects Area	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 90 Beneficial Use Designation	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 91 SDGFB Stream Classifications	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 92 Aquatic Management Indicator Species	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 93 Average Mountain Sucker Populations	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 94 Average Brown Trout Populations	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 95 Average Brook Trout Populations	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 96 Black Hills National Forest (BHNF) R2 Sensitive Plant Species	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 97 BHNF Northern Zone Plant Species of Interest in the Project Area	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 98 Noxious Weed Risk Assessment	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 99 Alternative 2 Treatment Acreages	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 100 Alternative 3 Treatment Acreages	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 101 Alternative 4 Treatment Acreages	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Table 102 Present Net Value and Benefit/Cost Ration by Alternative	Error! Bookmark not defined.